Book Reviews

Making All Things New: Inaugurated Eschatology for the Life of the Church. By Benjamin L. Gladd and Matthew S. Harmon with introductory chapter by G. K. Beale. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2016, xix + 199 pp., $20.00 paper.

In academic biblical studies it is not uncommon to encounter *inaugurated eschatology,* the New Testament (NT) understanding that God's new creational kingdom has, on the one hand, erupted into the present evil age through Jesus Christ, but, on the other hand, acknowledge that the kingdom awaits full realization at the consummation with the second coming of Christ. Such discussions of inaugurated eschatology are very common in NT theologies and systematic theologies focused on the last things. Nevertheless, as Benjamin Gladd and Matthew Harmon rightly find, this perspective has not significantly impacted the ministry of the church. They "attempt to explain how the already-not yet framework informs our understanding of the life and ministry of the church" (xii). Their aim is to show that inaugurated eschatology shapes the nature of the church, the Christian life, pastoral leadership, and the function of the church in worship, prayer, and missions.

The book is straightforward in its organization and structure. Part one of the book builds the theological foundation. Since Gladd and Harmon studied under and are heavily influenced by G. K. Beale, the first chapter is written by him. Beale ably traverses the biblical storyline and convincingly demonstrates how the "latter day" hopes and prophecies based in the Old Testament (OT) have been set in motion in the present through the life, death, and resurrection of Christ and the formation of the church. The climax of the latter days is still future as believers live between the times, anticipating the resurrection of the body and the new heavens and earth. Next, in chapter two Harmon describes the nature of the church as the eschatological people of God. While trying to walk a line between dispensational and covenant theology, Harmon presents the church as the new covenant community (Jer 31), the restored latter-day Israel and eschatological remnant which has been redeemed through Christ and empowered by the long-hoped for Holy Spirit. Harmon maintains that the church is not a parenthesis, as in some forms of dispensational thought, but the church does not "replace" Israel either as God has not rejected the Jewish people (32-34). In chapter 3, Gladd describes "how believers live in accordance with the 'latter days,' particularly, how they are to behave as kingdom citizens, spiritually resurrected beings, and Spirit-led believers" (37). The kingdom and kingdom ethics have broken into the present world and as kingdom citizens, God's people are marked by love and service to the poor. Next, Gladd focuses on resurrection and explains how the latter-day concept of resurrection is another already-not yet reality. Believers in Christ are already spiritually resurrected and raised with Christ but in another sense, physical resurrection and the complete destruction of indwelling sin awaits the consummation (45-51). Lastly, the latter-day work of the Holy Spirit as it relates to creation, temple, God's law, and the kingdom are surveyed as are the implications for believers who are recipients of the initial fulfillment of the Spirit's work.

Part two focuses exclusively on pastors and leaders as they minister to God's people within the framework of inaugurated eschatology, particularly with regard to preaching (chapter 4) and guiding and guarding the flock (chapter 5 and 6). First, taking his cues from Acts and preaching of Paul, Harmon lays out how the already-not yet dynamic should shape preaching. He finds that preaching should emphasize what God has already done in Christ, call people to live in a manner consistent with the gospel, and instill a hope for the consummation of all things (74-76). Now that the latter days have dawned, Gladd takes up the topic of how pastors and leaders are to combat false teaching and respond to persecution in chapter 5. The topics of the man of lawlessness, antichrist figure(s), and the problem of false teachings are presented since the church lives in an age where the end-time tribulation has commenced. Rounding out part two is chapter 6. Gladd focuses on leadership as the overlap of the ages impacts how one is to lead by example, disciple others, and cultivate a vision for ministry. Leaders embody the cross in showing others how they suffer in the latter days and they are to nurture faith in others, discipling them as new creations in Christ (2 Cor 5:17). The message and conduct of pastors and leaders must be informed by the fact that they are held to a stricter scrutiny (1 Cor 4:1-5; Jas 3:1) with the sober reality of God's end-time judgment (105-109).

The third and final part of the book, written entirely by Harmon, concentrates on the eschatological service of God's end-time temple—the church—with respect to worship, prayer, and missions. Regarding worship, Harmon concentrates on the already-not yet nature of worship, how our worship is patterned after heavenly worship, and how present-day worship is participation in heavenly worship (Rev 4-5; Heb 12:18-29). Worship celebrates the covenantal relationship believers have with God and worship responds to who God is, his mighty works in the past, especially the death and resurrection of Jesus Christ, and the songs, prayers, and preaching should also point believers to the not yet—the redemption to be realized in the new heavens and earth (119-24). In chapter 8, Harmon demonstrates how the eschatological dynamic now present through Christ impacts prayer. Examining Jesus' and Paul's teaching on prayer (Matt 6:9-13; Eph 1:15-23; 1 Cor 1:4-9; Phil 1:3-11), prayer focuses on what God has already done and looks forward to the fullness of what God has promised. Lastly, a succinct biblical theology of missions is presented in chapter 9. Starting from the OT (the commission of Adam), Harmon explains how God's mission is fulfilled in Christ, carried out by his Spirit-indwelt followers, and consummated when God's presence fills the entire created order and in a renewed humanity in glory (Rev 21-22). Gladd rounds out the book with a chapter by chapter overview.

In terms of evaluation, the strengths and positive contributions of the book far outweigh its minor weaknesses. Beale's first chapter is excellent and deserves a careful reading in its own right. Beale helpfully lays out the eschatology of the OT and summarizes the ten ideas that compose the content of the "latter days" (7). The notions of kingdom, the restoration of Israel, return from exile, anticipation of a new covenant, the bestowal of Spirit, and so on are clearly invoked in the NT, as is the language of the "latter days." The end days have come to initial fulfillment through Christ and the church as Beale convincingly demonstrates.

Next, I really appreciated how Harmon and Gladd did not shy away from difficult biblical texts as they relate to eschatology and ministry of the church. The authors affirm that the restoration of Israel has begun as the church is the eschatological people of God (e.g. 16-31, 64-66, 104, 163-67) and they offer biblical support for this position. Closely tied to restoration is the new exodus and the prophetic hopes of a new temple, both of which are fulfilled through Christ with the entailment that the church is the people of the new exodus and the eschatological temple. While difficult biblical-theological areas, maintaining these truths are important for understanding the church and the ministry of the church now that the end days have dawned in Christ.

Also, in drawing key areas for ministry with a view to the already and not yet, other difficult or challenging areas were brought to the fore. For example, for a book focused on the life of the church one would not expect a discussion of the man of lawlessness (1 Thess 2:1-7; see pages 80-89), but this passage is brought into focus (along with the helpful links to Dan 11:29-36; 12:10) by Gladd. While this area is a source of debate, the main point should not be: pastoral leadership must guard and comfort the flock in the midst of tribulation and persecution and they must combat the onslaught of false teaching that derives from the end-time oppressor who is already here even though his full manifestation is not yet. For yet another example, 1 Corinthians 4:1-5 (and 1 Cor 3:10-15), a passage often overlooked for pastoral stewardship receives attention as does an insightful OT allusion to Daniel 2:22-23 in 1 Corinthians 4:5 (105-109). Stewardship over the mystery, the message of the cross, is imperative, for "Paul knows that the Lord will one day hold him accountable, at the very end of history, for preaching a gospel that is free from deceit and error" (109).

These specific points aside, another strength of this work is that Gladd and Harmon draw out implications and practical suggestions at the end of each chapter. While there are many theological points and attention on inaugurated eschatology, Gladd and Harmon never lose sight of pressing these teachings for the ministry of the church and the Christian life. Gladd and Harmon are keen to explore what it means to live in the presence of the kingdom even as we await the full manifestation of the kingdom.

Despite these excellent points, there were areas that could have used much more refinement and analysis. With regard to the nature of the new covenant community, while the authors rightly emphasize the church as the end-time people of God who receive the promised blessings and inheritance through their identification with Christ, more development of the new covenant was needed (20-23). While it is certainly true that Jeremiah 31 "is about a democratization of the priestly and prophetic roles within the end-time community of faith" (22), much more treatment of the fact that the new covenant people will *all* know the Lord and will have the law written on their hearts was needed along with the ecclesiological implications. Coupling the fact that *all* will know the Lord *and* possess the Holy Spirit with the truth that these ones will also experience the complete and final forgiveness of sin (Jer 31:34), does not this passage point to a faithful, regenerate end-time covenant community? Is there not a significant discontinuity between Israel and the church, namely, that the church is *not* a mixed community of believers and unbelievers as Israel was? One of the difficulties at this point is that the authors are not in agreement (21n5). In addition, I think Gladd's discussion of the fulfillment of the law (40-41) could use much more development. The law is internalized in the hearts of believers, but Matthew 5:17 seems to be indicating more than this as the law as a whole, not just external aspects and ceremonial regulations, has come to fulfillment in Jesus.

While there are some areas that could have been developed more, *Making All Things New* is a very helpful work that deserves wide-readership, especially among pastors and other church leaders. Gladd and Harmon have convincingly shown that the already-not yet framework within Scripture should impact and reorient how we conceive of the church, how pastors minister to the flock, and how followers of Jesus worship, pray, and serve God in missionary endeavors.

Brent E. Parker
Assistant Editor, *The Southern Baptist Journal of Theology*

Augustine's Theology of Angels. By Elizabeth Klein. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018, 212 pp, $74.19. Hard cover.

There is a well-known saying about Augustine: anyone who claims to have read all his works is liar. That statement certainly describes anyone who thinks they have read everything written *about* Augustine's life, philosophy, and theology. A myriad of books and articles populate the field of Augustinian studies because the Bishop of Hippo reigns as the most pivotal figure in church history, indeed in western civilization. As such, his works have engendered a copious range of scholarly and pastoral attention for the past 1600 years.

Despite the prolonged analysis of Augustine's works, scholars continue to yield fruitful studies of his theology and writings. In 2018, Elizabeth Klein, who earned her PhD from the University of Notre Dame and currently serves as a professor of theology at the Augustine Institute in Denver, provided a gem for Augustinian studies when she unearthed a crucial yet underdeveloped theme that permeates Augustine's works: his theology of angels. Klein's *Augustine's Theology of Angels,* published by Cambridge University Press, sheds light on Augustine's angelology—specifically, how his angelology intersects with the economy of salvation and redemptive history. Klein, moreover, boldly suggests that unless students of Augustine understand his angelology, they cannot fully grasp his larger theological system.

Klein organizes her book into four chapters with an introduction and conclusion. Each chapter focuses on a different aspect of Augustine's angelology and explores the roles of angels in (1) creation, (2) community, (3) salvation history, and (4) spiritual warfare. Here methodology represents a careful approach that concerns itself with Augustine and his historical context. She guards against proof texting and aims to maintain the integrity of Augustine's literary works. Klein admits in her introduction that though Augustine never devoted a single work to angelology, angels and demons saturate many of his most important theological works—indeed, Augustine presents through his writings a consistent and steady system of angels and demons in soteriology as well as an angelic paradigm for sacramental worship for the church.

Klein, furthermore, argues that historical-theologians must remember the *historical* element when delving into the annuls of theological antiquity. Chronological chauvinism breeds poor historiography. Klein believes that "although the mediation of angels seems to have little hold in the imagination of modern scholars, this was not the case for an ancient religious adherent" (2). Thus, the questions of modernity must not supersede the questions and worldview of historical figures. Some historians enter the past with burdensome presuppositions and critical motivations—an attitude that will veil the past as it happened and obscure important theological insights. A right historiography, as Klein has done her book, approaches the past with a desire to listen, learn, and ask the questions that the subject would have asked. This historiographical principle flows throughout Klein's book and subsequently presents the reader not only with a definitive assessment of Augustine's angelology but the significant role of angels in Augustine's mind and overall theological framework.

Chapter 1 distills the role of angels in creation—an important issue for Augustine because he engaged in polemics against Manicheans who believed a cosmic conflict engulfed the creation between two coeternal forces of light and darkness. Augustine, in his various works on Genesis and in his *Confessions*, refutes a Manichean worldview and instead posits the subordination of the angelic host as creatures of the almighty God. Augustine, therefore, develops and angelology in the turbulent sea of theodicy as he wrestles with the origin of evil and the fall of the angels.

First, Augustine dispenses with theories of preexistent events before Genesis 1:1. Before time, there was only God. God created *ex nihilo* and this includes the angels. Klein observes that Augustine curtails any Manichean notion of two, coeternal forces in conflict—rather, God, as the supreme and eternal good, created all things out of nothing and made everything in the cosmos good. The existence of evil, therefore, flows not from God and hence is not an eternal force in opposition to God's will.

Klein draws out Augustine's juxtaposition of the angelic fall with the fall of humanity to further enforce the created nature of angels. Indeed, the fall of the angels, in Augustine's belief, arose from the same restlessness that Satan would use to tempt Adam and Eve—the angels failed to cling to God as their source of life and joy. As Klein interacts with Augustine's *City of God* and *Literal Meaning of Genesis*, she discovers that Augustine believed God created the angelic host on the first day of creation that they might behold the creative power of God in the rest of creation and render to him worship and praise. Klein writes, "On day one the angels receive knowledge of God first, then of themselves in the evening. The next morning, they return to the Word aglow with praise for their own creation and glimpse again what will be created on day two, the firmament" (28). Augustine, therefore, posited an angelic doxology that unfolded with the subsequent days of creation. Klein believes Augustine's interpretive framework suggests three profound elements of his overall theological system: (1) that God intended creation pedagogically, (2) that angels must and can only be creatures of the creator God, and (3) that time has a "sacramental quality" (29). By pedagogically, Augustine heralded the *goodness* of creation—as God creates, his creatures marvel at his creative work and render praise unto his glory. As creatures, the angels who lapsed represent the perversion of the liberty to love God completely while the faithful angels embody the future state of humanity wherein mankind will revel in the perfected freedom to possess God and his glory in fullness. By sacramental, Augustine believed the angelic participation in creation points to the importance of signs or sacraments in the worship of God.

In chapter two, Klein discusses Augustine's formulation of the angelic community and their relationship to the church of Jesus Christ. The angelic community flourishes in bonds of felicity and communal praise—hallmarks of the type of community that should mark the church and God's people. Augustine's angelology is often typological of the human experience: the good angels represent the fullness of joy that Christians long to share while the evil angels typify the consequences of sin; the former embody the character that the church should strive to emulate while the latter corresponds to warning. The demons seek happiness and praise in their own being while the angels exude self-giving love that marks the community of God. Klein observes that "the good angels have attached themselves to God and seek to draw others into that relationship rather than to attract praise to themselves; that is the demonic impulse" (62). Augustine's angelology, therefore, gravitates around worship. The angels are creatures of worship. They exist to praise God and to draw others into the celestial community of praise.

Klein believes Augustine's angelology points to two diametrically opposed forms of worship communities. The two communities share many of the same worship practice—the showing of reverence and honor—yet the object of each community's worship is distinct. Crucial for Klein's argument is *The City of God* wherein Augustine divided the cosmos into two different cities: the city of man and the city of God. The city of man, ruled by the demons, suffers under the weight of self-love and deceit while the city of God casts the radiant light of divine love—a love that is not self-seeking but sacrificial. Humility, as defined fully by the incarnation, marks the city of God.

Thus, as Klein observes, Augustin posits two communities that exist in the present life. She writes, "The two cities are cities composed of neighbors, defined by their love (or lack thereof) for the neighbor" (73). The good angels, in display of God's providence, come alongside the will of God and draw God's people into the heavenly community that is marked by worship of God. Community with the angels, therefore, has an "eschatological orientation"—present community with the good angels remains veiled until the fullness of time when Christ lifts the veil and the host of humanity joins together with the hosts of heaven for a perennial communion. Significantly, Klein draws out important implications of the communal angelology present in Augustine's works: primarily, the familial bonds the unite humanity with the angels expresses that angels are not authoritative, unknowable creatures. The good angels have a distinct role the in the economy of salvation—they summon God's people to join them in the praise of God. Moreover, Klein deduces immense pastoral concerns present in Augustine's angelology: the belief in the active presence of angels abounded in Augustine's day; he needed to protect his flock from the myriad of distortions that permeated the ancient world. Klein helpfully draws out the implications of Augustine's theology of angels. Secular society (and even modern evangelicalism) gives little thought to the importance of angels. Subsequently, modern scholarship has overlooked its importance throughout the history of the church. Klein, however, adopts a sound historiography that elevates the concerns, thoughts, and theological quandaries Augustine faced to the fore of her book. She highlights the importance of, to the modern reader, an obscure doctrine—a doctrine, however, that had enormous implications for Augustine's overall theology and pastoral ministry.

Chapter three surveys the role of angels in salvation history. Augustine believed the angels played a prominent role in the dispensing of the old covenant. He did not, according to Klein, interpret the appearance of the Son to Old Testament saints in passages like Genesis 18. This marks a departure from much of patristic hermeneutic. Augustine objected to a preincarnate Christ because it interrupted the narrative of Scripture which "culminates in the incarnation" (111). Augustine, therefore, believed the theophanies of the Old Testament were carried out by the angels who served God as harbingers of his message and will to the people of Israel.

Klein persuasively argues that Augustine's understanding of angels in the Old Testament mirrors the prophets. Augustine, therefore, believed angels have a personal character—though Isaiah proclaimed God's revelation, he was no less the man Isaiah. In the same way, angels retain a personal character as they fulfilled a prophetic assignment in God's covenantal economy with Israel.

Klein moves on to consider Augustine's view of the incarnation—specifically, how angels functioned in the seismic shift of redemptive history when God came and dwelt among men. Augustine believed that all throughout the Old Testament every angelic event foreshadowed and prepared the way for the incarnation. Klein's analysis helpfully demonstrates the centrality of the incarnation in Augustine's theology as well as the crucial role of angels in the unfolding of God's redemptive purposes. Indeed, for Augustine, the role of angels in redemptive history was to announce the coming of the Messiah (122).

Klein turns to Augustine's Christmas sermons and homilies, which contain numerous references to the angelic vocation at Christ's incarnation. Indeed, the angelic ministry centers on the incarnation—from the Old Testament to the New Testament, Augustine's angelology abounds with incarnational imagery as angels, by God's will, participate in the entire scope of redemptive history. Klein, furthermore, notes that the angels continue to bear witness to and announce the meaning of the incarnation at Christ's ascension (see Acts 1:11).

Klein concludes with a foray into the reason Augustine believed that angels played such a prominent role in salvation history. Klein argues,

> God uses angels, according to Augustine, both for the benefit of the angels themselves and for our benefit as creatures. This understanding reveals a more general respect for creation on his part … He also suggests that the angels have a special aesthetic quality and that they provide an authoritative witness to God's work, both of which make their participation in the economy of salvation valuable. (139)

This keen insight from Klein unearths the significance of Augustine's angelology with his entire theology of salvation. Though God does not need the angels to fulfill his will, he graciously enlists the angels to support the unfolding of his mysterious will—this God does so that his angels might enjoy the pleasure of their divine prerogative.

Finally, chapter four takes up a central pastoral issue for Augustine's theology of angels: spiritual warfare. This chapter redounds with sound historiography and theological awareness on the part of Klein. She uses as her primary source Augustine's sermons—especially his exposition of the Psalms. By drawing from Augustine's sermons, Klein offers fresh insight into another underdeveloped theme of Augustine's life, namely, his pastoral ministry. The world knows of Augustine the philosopher or Augustine the theologian. Few, however, have reflected on Augustine the pastor—the occupation that he held for the majority of his life. He served one congregation for the totality of his ministry. By drawing from his sermons, Klein casts a new light on this enigmatic figure and provides a compelling distillation of Augustine's theology of spiritual warfare.

By focusing on Augustine's exposition of the Psalms, Klein uncovers a hermeneutical principle Augustine deployed: he believed that "any psalm which speaks of combat, war, violence or victory is understood to pertain to the struggle of the church, of Christ or of the individual against the devil" (149). Moreover, Augustine interpreted precatory psalms as battle cries, not against earthly foes, but against Satan and his demonic cohort. Augustine's interpretation of Psalm 34 reveals that he subordinates the fleshly foe of the Psalm to the cosmic forces of evil that wage war against Christians.

Augustine's conceptualization of spiritual warfare imbued his pastoral ministry with a constant summons to the spiritual disciplines: prayer, obedience, and the liturgical practices of the church. Saints meet their enemy in the mundane events of life—the commonplace occurrences that can give rise to vice, anger, and pride. The devil lies behind the temptations Christians face always attempting to lure them away from their pursuit of holiness. Indeed, as Klein has consistently argued, Augustine's angelology centered on worship—either worship of self away from God or true worship directed towards God.

Perhaps Klein's most insightful comment comes in the conclusion of the chapter. She writes, "Spiritual warfare ... serves as a hermenutical key for Augustine in his Psalm commentaries; if Christ ... is the speaker of each one of the Psalms, then the devil must always be the enemy to whom the speaker is referring" (184). Spiritual warfare, therefore, served as the paradigmatic lens of Augustine's exposition of the Psalter. Thus, Augustine's ministry was shaped by his angelology and the warfare imagery depicted in the psalms. As Augustine read, interpreted, and preached the psalms, he summoned his people to a cosmic conflict—a war waged not for the physical cities of the earth but a war between the city of the devil and the city of God.

Klein's book is a most welcome addition to Augustinian studies. Her book provides a swath of theological insight into the mind and ministry of Augustine. Klein successfully guides her reader through the massive corpus of Augustine's literature and demonstrates the significant place of angels in the bishop's theology. Their role in creation, community, salvation, and in war proves her original assertion in the introduction: students of Augustine cannot fully grasp his theology if they are sundered from his angelology. Scholars of history, theology, and patristics will welcome this insightful, well written, and substantive study on this neglected aspect of Augustine's theology.

Cory D. Higdon
PhD Student, The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary

Peculiar Orthodoxy: Reflections on Theology and the Arts. By Jeremy S. Begbie. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2018, 214 pp., $32.00.

Jeremy Begbie currently serves as the Thomas A. Langford Distinguished Professor of Theology at Duke Divinity School. He has done a significant amount of work in studying the interaction of music and theology, publishing several books and articles as well as serving as editor for many others. In addition, Begbie is also an accomplished musician, something that no doubt impacts his understanding of the subject matter presented here. He is undoubtedly one of the current leading voices in the "theology and the arts" discussions, and thus, well worth reading.

This book is a collection of essays, all previously published, but collected with some minor editing where necessary in this volume so that, among other things, a wider audience might gain access to them. The essays address individual topics, and as a result coherence throughout the book is provided by Begbie's approach rather than by any particular topic. Due to the somewhat self-contained nature of each chapter, the book serves wonderfully as an introduction to several different aspects of theological interactions with the arts (or perhaps more accurately, artistic interactions with theology) without burdening a neophyte reader in the subject with extended argumentation. Each chapter can be digested on its own, or if the entire book is taken in, the reader can benefit from the interplay between the essays in order to get a wider-lens view of Begbie's thought. A selection of the chapters will be reviewed here.

The first two chapters deal with the subject of beauty from differing perspectives. As the notion of beauty has been reentering artistic discussions (184), these two chapters are helpful. The first investigates the production of beauty within the music of J. S. Bach. Thankfully, Begbie doesn't settle for simple hagiography of Bach's work, but instead works through some evaluations of particular musical features that it displays. Begbie's analysis interacts seriously with the music, but it does so without being overly technical, and thus even a non-musician may easily benefit. The focus is on the way that Bach crafted his music, not by rigid mathematical progressions, but by finding a pattern that could be built upon with variations and responses such that none of the notes seem inevitable, and yet all of them seem proper (16). In this way, Begbie sees Bach's work as, in many ways, reflecting the creative nature of God worked out through the Trinity; diversity and unity without limitation is a trajectory that Begbie sees in Bach's music, and it is evident in full in the work of the Father, Spirit, and Son.

In the second chapter, Begbie moves away from the intricate complexities of Bach and interacts with the matter of sentimentality. Rather than simply dismissing this as a sort of un-artistic tear-jerking, Begbie proposes a model for understanding what the deficiencies in sentimentality actually are and a way in which they can be recovered to productive artistic use. He imagines the three days of Easter as a paradigm for understanding art. All three days must be acknowledged by our perspectives and by our art if we are to remain properly balanced. "Christian sentimentalism arises from a premature grasp for Easter morning." (41) If we don't let the reality of "Friday" (the crucifixion, the harsh side of reality) impact our art but instead look only forward to the happier day of Easter, we will end up with sentimental art that can't truly communicate to people whose daily experience is more like the despair of "Friday" or the troubled waiting of "Saturday."

Begbie's third chapter helpfully focuses on the role that emotion plays in worship. While emotion is so easily dismissed or at least viewed skeptically within some Christians circles, and in others is seemingly elevated to normative status, Begbie lays out what he believes is a proper role for emotion in worship. He finds the concept of "concentration," the process of developing specific emotions with a specific target, very helpful, particularly the concentration of emotion on the person of Jesus. What the church needs in worship is not less emotion, but more, and better, emotion. Too often, he notes, worship involves music that is too emotionally simple, "supporting only the broadest and most basic emotions." (76)

In chapter five, Begbie does an excellent job of evaluating the early modern music of Edward Elgar, particularly his rendition of John Henry Newman's poem, *The Dream of Gerontius*. Begbie demonstrates the connection between the music, specifically the chord and note progressions, and the thematic or story-line material that is being presented (100-101), but he goes one (very helpful) step further and comments on the consistency between Elgar's life and his music and his subject matter (105). Noting how Elgar's music accurately portrays the fear of judgment and the desire for purgatory that is present in Roman Catholic thought including Newman's poem, Begbie is not afraid to assert that the tentative hope that Elgar's music expresses (and that Elgar himself felt) is biblically deficient (109). In Begbie, it is certainly refreshing to read an artist/theologian who, while being impeccably respectful, is still willing to make a meaningful practical distinction between Roman Catholicism and Protestant faith.

Throughout the entire book Begbie's writing is clear and engaging, but the aspect of his writing that is most appreciated is the way in which the historic orthodoxy of the Christian faith, and especially the content of the Scriptures, provides boundaries for the appreciation and analysis of artistic creations. One of the most common themes throughout the book is the repeated reference to God as triune (5) and to the way that art engages trinitarian themes (17). In fact, according to Begbie, the

Trinity provides the grounding for beauty itself: given that the Triune God is characterized by "the dynamism of outgoing love, then primordial beauty is the beauty of this ecstatic love for the other." (4) This unabashed centering on a unique feature of the Christian God may not be the most popular move in the art world, but it is certainly part of the path to having good "theology and the arts."

In addition to the centrality of the Triune nature of God, Begbie also maintains a distinct emphasis on the role that Scripture plays in defining not only our theology but also our understanding for the roles that the arts can and should play. In chapter four, Begbie interacts with some of the published comments of David Brown, a significant "arts theologian." Where Brown proposes an art that is free to reinterpret both Scripture and church tradition as it finds need (82), Begbie responds by acknowledging Brown's concerns but then demonstrates that not only should Scripture be normative for our understanding and production of art (88), an art so constrained (and here he draws on Bach as a paradigm) would actually be better and more productive than art lacking such constraint (89).

In all, Begbie demonstrates not only great skill in guiding others through the world of interactions between theology and the arts, he also demonstrates a willingness to be, first of all, an orthodox Christian in the world of art. He doesn't try to blend away the distinctiveness of being a Christian, but rather, he promotes theological orthodoxy based in Scripture as the ultimate means of developing meaningful and rich art. Many may benefit from this book, and if artists embody Begbie's approach to the arts, the world will benefit.

George Scondras
PhD Student, The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary

Persecution and Participation in Galatians. By John Anthony Dunne. WUNT 2.454. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2017. 248 pp., $96.10, paperback.

Persecution is a repeated theme in the book of Galatians (e.g., 1:13, 23; 4:29; 5:11; 6:12), and yet the theme has been neglected or downplayed by most scholars. In his published dissertation, John Anthony Dunne attempts a comprehensive account of the theme of persecution in Galatians. Dunne seeks to demonstrate that "in Galatians, Paul is informed by the Christ-event and the full implications of participation with Christ in such a way that he sees suffering for the sake of the cross not as incidental, but as one of the alternative marks to circumcision, which demarcates the true people of God, and sets them apart for future blessing" (4). After reviewing the history of research in chapter 1, in chapter 2 Dunne examines Galatians 3:4, 4:6–7, and 4:28–5:1 and concludes that suffering marks Christian identity (sonship) and destiny (inheritance). In chapter 3, on the basis of Galatians 6:11–17, Dunne argues that suffering serves as a means of "participation in the cross" and thus indicates "who will therefore be vindicated at the final judgment" (88). Since Paul bears the marks of a slave of Christ (Gal 1:10; 6:17), he expects the Galatians to become slaves as well (Gal 6:2). In chapter 4, Dunne claims that Paul's emphasis on suffering and slavery in Galatians echoes Isaiah. In this claim, he builds on the earlier work of Matthew S. Harmon (*She Must and Shall Go Free: Paul's Isaianic Gospel in Galatians*, De Gruyter, 2010). Dunne's argument can be summarized in three steps: (1) Paul echoes Isaiah 53 when he describes Jesus' death (Gal 1:4; 2:20; cf. Isa 53:5–6, 10, 12). (2) Paul presents himself as the Isaianic servant from Isaiah 49 (Gal 1:10, 15–16, 24; 2:2; cf. Isa 49:1–6). He is thus the servant of the Servant, displaying the Servant's suffering and indwelt by his Spirit. (3) Finally, Paul calls on the Galatians to imitate him as suffering servants (Gal 4:12–5:1; Isa 49–54). The true people of God, therefore, are those who imitate Paul as he participates in the sufferings of Christ.

Dunne's research represents the most comprehensive attempt to understand the topic of persecution in Galatians to date, and the quality of his research only serves to buttress the value of his work. Dunne, rightly, argues that the persecution theme serves a theological purpose in Galatians and is thus not merely an incidental circumstance of the letter. One of those theological purposes is to mark the identity of God's true people, the true heirs of God, in contrast with the Old Covenant mark of circumcision. Students of Galatians would do well to wrestle with Dunne's work as a way to fully appreciate the contribution that the persecution theme makes to Paul's argument.

Nonetheless, I would point to two chief criticisms of Dunne's work. First, Dunne shows little concern for understanding the historical background to the persecution referenced in Galatians. He acknowledges this in his conclusion by identifying historical reconstruction as an area for further research. This issue, however, cannot be isolated from exegesis. Two recent trends in Pauline studies in particular—Paul within Judaism and Paul and Empire—demonstrate how significant historical reconstruction is to understand the theology of the text. These trends offer unique readings of Galatians based on particular understandings of the historical evidence. For example, without historical reconstruction the interpreter cannot easily identify instances when Paul might be using the theme to accomplish polemical purposes rather than addressing the historical setting of his readers. If Paul is using διώκω in Galatians 4:29 polemically to refer to false teaching rather than physical or social hostility, then this would tell us something significant about Paul's understanding of the concept of persecution as well as his conception of false teaching. Dunne attempts to evade the issue, and thus he must interpret references to persecution at face value.

Second, Dunne's emphasis on Isaianic echoes in chapter 4 is the weakest aspect of his argument. Dunne appeals to broad echoes of Isaiah 49–54 throughout the book of Galatians as the basis of Paul's theology of persecution. If one can only understand the echoes to Isaiah, then one can fully understand Paul's theology of persecution in Galatians. The emphasis, therefore, is placed on what is underneath the text of Galatians as the key to understanding the letter. While some (but not all) of Dunne's identified echoes exist, it may be better to seek as simpler and clearer explanation of Paul's theology of persecution from a surface reading of Galatians itself. Nevertheless, despite these two weaknesses, Dunne's work remains a significant contribution to scholarship on Galatians, and those who would preach or teach Galatians would do well to grapple with Dunne's arguments. No preacher should exposit Galatians without exhorting his congregation to bear the mark of suffering.

Joshua Caleb Hutchens,
President, Gospel Life Global Missions